COMPREHENSIVE NUTRIENT GAP ASSESSMENT (CONGA)

FINDINGS FOR CHILDREN 6-23 MONTHS IN ETHIOPIA

December 2019







WHY IS CONGA NEEDED?

After a child's first six months, nutrient requirements exceed what breastmilk alone can provide. To meet growing nutrient needs and ensure proper growth and development, along with breastfeeding, infants should be introduced to nutrient-dense solid, semi-solid, or soft foods at six months of age (1,2). Despite this, only 14% of infants and young children aged 6–23 months in Ethiopia consume a diet meeting the minimum recommended number of food groups (3), increasing their risk of micronutrient deficiencies and growth faltering.

Identification of nutrient and dietary gaps during the complementary feeding period is essential to inform policies and programs designed to improve child health and nutrition. However, nationally-representative data specific to young children are usually only available for select nutrients and infrequently collected. Lower quality evidence can help fill data gaps, particularly when multiple sources point to the same nutrients of concern or dietary issues. Yet decision makers have little guidance on how to locate and interpret the evidence to identify the magnitude and significance of nutrient gaps in child diets, given the wide range of indicators used, diversity of data sources and population characteristics, and differences in severity of associated health outcomes. A Comprehensive Nutrient Gap Assessment (CONGA) meets this need by collating the evidence and rating the burden of nutrient gaps¹ and certainty of evidence. This brief summarizes the main food and micronutrient gaps identified from a CONGA conducted in Ethiopia and key policy and programmatic actions required. There are several other nutrients that may be limited in the diets of young children, including omega-3 fats (e.g., DHA) and specific essential amino acids (i.e., the quality of protein). The CONGA method can be extended in the future to these and others as more data becomes available.

KEY MESSAGES

- Based on available evidence, **iron**, **zinc**, **iodine**, **vitamin A**, and **calcium** are micronutrients of concern among young children in Ethiopia.
- **More research** is required on **other nutrients**, like folate and vitamin C, which may also represent important gaps in young children's diets in Ethiopia.
- The best food sources of micronutrients of concern in Ethiopia are chicken liver (iron, zinc, vitamin A), beef liver (iron, vitamin A), beef (iron, zinc), Ethiopian kale (iron, vitamin A, calcium), eggs (zinc and vitamin A), lentils (iron), milk (calcium, vitamin A), and groundnuts (zinc).
- **More research** is needed to understand the primary barriers to consuming these foods, such as limited **availability**, **accessibility**, **affordability**, or **desirability**.
- Ethiopia needs to improve coverage of **adequately iodized salt**.
- **Biofortification**, **fortification**, and **supplementation** can also help fill gaps for micronutrients of concern, particularly where food insecurity, social norms, palatability, and desirability make sufficient consumption from accessible diverse foods infeasible.

¹ Micronutrients investigated via CONGA include iron, vitamin A, zinc, calcium, iodine, Vitamin B_1 (thiamine), niacin, vitamin B_{12} , vitamin B_6 , folate, and vitamin C.

HOW DOES CONGA WORK?

We reviewed and summarized findings from nationally representative and quality sub-national surveys, grey literature, and journal articles related to infant and young child feeding practices, micronutrient deficiencies, dietary intake, household consumption and expenditure, and the food supply. Experts reviewed this evidence to rate the burden of gap (none, low, moderate, or high) and certainty of available evidence (low, moderate, or high) for 11 micronutrients commonly lacking in young children's diets.² We then identified the most nutrient-dense, locally available food sources of micronutrients of concern based on food composition data and local price data.

WHAT DID CONGA FIND IN ETHIOPIA?

Based on available evidence, micronutrients of concern³ during the complementary feeding period in Ethiopia are **iron**, **zinc**, **iodine**, **vitamin A**, and **calcium** (Table 1). The annex describes specific evidence considered for all ratings. We summarize consequences of deficiencies in micronutrients of concern and justifications for their ratings below.

	Iron	Zinc	lodine	Vit A	Са	Folate	Vit C	Vit B ₁₂	Vit \mathbf{B}_1	Niacin	Vit B ₆
Gap burden	High	High	High	Mod	Mod	Mod	Mod	Low	Low	Low	None
Evidence certainty	High	High	High	High	Mod	Low	Low	Low	Low	Low	Low

Table 1. Nutrient gaps and evidence ratings for children 6–23 months in Ethiopia⁴

Iron

Iron deficiency is a primary cause of anemia and can result in cognitive impairment, decreased work productivity, and death (4). Data reveal low availability of iron in the national food supply and inadequate iron consumption during the complementary feeding period, and recent national surveys indicate high prevalence of iron deficiency and anemia in young children.

Zinc

Zinc deficiency in children is associated with poor health, increased risk of diarrhea, and impaired cognitive and motor development (5,6). Data indicate very low availability of zinc in the national food supply, and both consumption and modeling data suggest high levels of inadequate zinc intake during the complementary feeding period. Recent national surveys indicate high prevalence of zinc deficiency in young children.

lodine

lodine deficiency has severe consequences, including growth and cognitive impairment, goiter,⁵ and death (7). Biochemical data and estimates of goiter prevalence indicate a large gap in intake. While recent national assessments of household salt iodization suggest coverage is relatively high, quality of iodization needs substantial improvement.

² Iron, zinc, iodine, vitamin A, calcium, folate, vitamin C, vitamin B₁₂, thiamine, niacin, and vitamin B₆.

³ Micronutrients of concern are those with at least a moderate burden gap *and* moderate certainty of evidence. There may also be other important nutrient gaps, but evidence is limited.

⁴ Ca, Calcium; Mod, Moderate; Vit, Vitamin.

⁵ Abnormal enlargement of the thyroid gland, typically caused by iodine deficiency.

Vitamin A

Vitamin A deficiency has severe consequences, even with mild deficiency, including night blindness, increased susceptibility to infections, and death (8). Data reveal very low availability of vitamin A in the national food supply and inadequate consumption of vitamin A-rich foods by infants and young children. Recent national estimates of vitamin A deficiency indicate a problem of moderate public health significance for young children in Ethiopia.

Calcium

Calcium deficiency increases risk of rickets, but the broader health implications of deficiency in young children are poorly understood (9). Data on availability of calcium in the national food supply and intake of calcium and calcium-rich foods in young children suggest calcium needs are widely unmet in children and the broader population. However, no biochemical data was available to indicate the level of deficiency.

Other micronutrients

Burdens of folate, thiamine, niacin, and vitamins C, B_6 , and B_{12} gaps were based on low-certainty evidence. More data is needed to generate higher quality evidence on the burden of these nutrient gaps in Ethiopia, particularly for folate and vitamin C.

WHAT CAN BE DONE TO ADDRESS THESE GAPS?

Recommended actions to address each nutrient gap in Ethiopia are summarized in Table 2. The best complementary food sources of micronutrients of concern are **chicken liver** (iron, zinc, vitamin A), **beef liver** (iron, vitamin A), **beef** (iron, zinc), **Ethiopian kale** (iron, vitamin A, calcium), **eggs** (zinc, vitamin A), **lentils** (iron), **milk** (calcium, vitamin A), and **groundnuts** (zinc) (Table 2). More research is needed to understand the primary barriers to consuming these foods, like limited availability, accessibility, affordability, or desirability. **Biofortified** and **fortified** foods (including fortified complementary foods), **point-of-use fortification** products like micronutrient powders and lipid-based nutrient supplements, and supplements can also help fill nutrient gaps. **Continued breastfeeding** rates in Ethiopia are high, yet evidence suggests a possible decline since 2005 (3). Efforts to maintain continued breastfeeding rates should be prioritized to help fill iodine, vitamin A, and calcium gaps. Improving the **quality** of **pregnant** and **lactating women's diets** can also improve their children's nutrition through improved birth outcomes, nutrient transfers at birth, and more nutrient-dense breast milk (10). While coverage of iodized salt is high, **quality** of **salt iodization** needs improvement.

Nutrient gap	Recommended actions to increase dietary intake
Nutrient gap	Recommended actions to increase dietary intake
Iron	 Assess and ensure availability, accessibility, affordability, and desirability of natural foods rich in iron, including chicken liver, beef liver, Ethiopian kale, beef, and lentils, as well as iron-biofortified and fortified foods. Ensure adequate coverage and quality of large-scale iron fortification. Consider micronutrient powders and/or supplementation.⁶
Zinc	 Assess and ensure availability, accessibility, affordability, and desirability of natural foods rich in zinc, including beef, chicken, chicken liver, groundnuts, and eggs, as well as zinc-biofortified and fortified foods. Ensure adequate coverage and quality of large-scale zinc fortification. Consider micronutrient powders and/or supplementation.
lodine	 Maintain high rates of continued breastfeeding. Ensure availability of, access to, and use of adequately iodized salt.
Vitamin A	 Maintain high rates of continued breastfeeding. Assess and ensure availability, accessibility, affordability, and desirability of natural foods rich in vitamin A, including beef liver, chicken liver, carrots, Ethiopian kale, pumpkin, eggs, fresh milk, and cottage cheese, as well as vitamin A-biofortified and fortified foods. Ensure adequate coverage and quality of large-scale vitamin A fortification. Consider micronutrient powders and/or continued supplementation.⁷
Calcium	 Maintain high rates of continued breastfeeding. Assess and ensure availability, accessibility, affordability, and desirability of natural foods rich in calcium, including Ethiopian kale and milk, as well as calcium-fortified foods. Consider calcium-containing micronutrient powders and/or supplementation. Collect biochemical and dietary data in young children.

Table 2. Recommended actions to address complementary feeding gaps in Ethiopia

⁶ Some potential risks have been associated with supplemental iron in children with adequate iron status. Products with low iron doses may be more appropriate in this context.

⁷ Vitamin A toxicity can occur if excess is consumed over long time periods. Vitamin A supplementation programs should review status and dietary intake regularly.

CONCLUSION

There is clear evidence of significant complementary feeding gaps in iron, zinc, iodine, vitamin A, and calcium in Ethiopia. There may also be other important gaps, but evidence is limited. The best food sources of micronutrients of concern that are relatively available in Ethiopia are chicken liver, beef liver, beef, Ethiopian kale, eggs, lentils, milk, and groundnuts. These foods need to be available, accessible, affordable, and desirable as complementary foods to be consumed in adequate quantities by young children. Other approaches to fill gaps for micronutrients of concern should also be considered, including biofortification, fortification, and supplementation, particularly where food insecurity, social norms, palatability, and desirability make sufficient consumption from accessible diverse foods infeasible. Continued breastfeeding should be encouraged and can help young children consume enough iodine, vitamin A, and calcium.

REFERENCES

- 1. Brown, K., Dewey, K., & Allen, L. World Health Organization. Complementary feeding of young children in developing countries: a review of current scientific knowledge. 1998.
- 2. Dewey, K. Pan American Health Organization. Guiding principles for complementary feeding of the breastfed child. 2002.
- 3. Central Statistical Agency, Ethiopia and ICF. Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey, 2016. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia and Calverton, Maryland, USA. 2016. <u>https://dhsprogram.com/pubs/pdf/FR328/</u>FR328.pdf.
- 4. Stoltzfus, R. J. Iron deficiency: global prevalence and consequences. Food and nutrition bulletin, 24 (4_suppl_1), S99-S103. 2003.
- 5. Black, M. M. Zinc deficiency and child development. The American journal of clinical nutrition, 68(2), 464S-469S.1998.
- 6. Semrad, C. E. Zinc and intestinal function. Current gastroenterology reports, 1(5), 398-403. 1999.
- 7. Zimmermann, M. B. Iodine deficiency. Endocrine reviews, 30(4), 376-408. 2009.
- 8. Sommer, A. World Health Organization. Vitamin A deficiency and its consequences: a field guide to detection and control. 1995.
- 9. Pettifor, J. M. Calcium and vitamin D metabolism in children in developing countries. Annals of Nutrition and Metabolism, 64(Suppl. 2), 15-22. 2014.
- 10. Allen, L. H. B vitamins in breast milk: relative importance of maternal status and intake, and effects on infant status and function. Advances in nutrition, 3(3), 362-369. 2012.

ANNEX

Iron	High burden gap	High certainty evidence
Biochemical data: The 2014/15 NMS found tha 18% as measured by serum ferritin $\leq 12 \mu g/L$ an mg/L. The same survey found prevalence of iror serum ferritin and soluble transferrin receptor, r DHS found prevalence of anemia in children 6–5	nd 30% as measured by sol n deficiency anemia to be 9 espectively, and prevalence	uble transferrin receptor ≥ 4.4 % and 12% as measured by e of anemia 34% (1). The 2016
Dietary data: According to DHS 22% of children nationally in 2016 (up from 13% in 2011) (2,3).	n 6–23 m consumed iron-r	ich foods in the past 24 h
Nutrient intake in children: A small 2010 study found adequate iron intake for children 12–23 m 6–35 m had inadequate iron intake (5).	_	
Diet modeling: An Optifood analysis ⁹ using data and Oromia found iron intake was between 24–5 12–23 m (6).		
Nutrient intake in WRA: Inadequate iron intake i	in 13% and excessive intake	in 64% in the 2011 FCS (5).
Food supply nutrient availability: The amount inadequate for 59% of the national population ir		d supply estimated to be
Zinc	High burden gap	High certainty evidence
Biochemical data: Prevalence of zinc deficience the 2014/15 NMS. The same survey also found c pregnant WRA (1).		
Dietary data: 8% children 6–23 m consumed n DHS (2).	neat, fish, or poultry in the	past 24 h nationally in the 2016
Nutrient intake in children: A small 2010 study Wollo found inadequate zinc intake for children 1 of children 6–35 m in Tigray, SNNPR, and Oromi provided) (5).	12–23 m (4). The 2011 natio	onal FCS found that > 95%
Diet modeling: An Optifood analysis using data		
and Oromia found inadequate zinc intake for all (6).		
	e in 50% in the 2011 FCS (5)).
(6).	of zinc available in the foo	

⁸ DHS, Demographic and Health Survey; FCS, Food Consumption Survey; h, hours; Mod, Moderate; m, months; NMS, National Micronutrient Survey; RNI, Reference Nutrient Intake; SNNPR, Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples' Region; WRA, women of reproductive age (15–49 years); y, years.

⁹ Optifood is a linear modeling tool that uses habitual dietary data to analyze the nutrients a population obtains from local diets and develop realistic food-based and non-food-based recommendations to optimize nutrient adequacy. The model also determines 'problem nutrients', for which recommended intakes are difficult to meet based on local food patterns.

lodine	High burden gap	High certainty evidence	
Biochemical data: National prevalence of iodine was 48% in children 5–14 y and 52% in WRA in t		e concentration < 100 µg/L)	
Goiter prevalence: Prevalence of goiter was 62 Northeastern Ethiopia (17) and 37% among scho 2017 (9).	-		
Household iodized salt coverage: 89% of hous found that while 89% of households used iodize (via rapid test kit analysis). When using the titrat iodized salt (with high variability between region	d salt, only 34% used adec tion method, only 26% of h	quately (\geq 15 ppm) iodized salt	
Vitamin A	Moderate burden gap	High certainty evidence	
Biochemical data: National vitamin A deficience 14% in the 2014/15 NMS (1).	y (serum retinol < 0.7 µmo	I/L) in children 6–59 m was	
Dietary data: According to DHS 38% of children nationally in 2016 (up from 26% in 2011) (2,3).	n 6–23 m consumed vitam	in A-rich foods in the past 24 h	
Nutrient intake in children: A small 2010 study found intake of vitamin A was < 50% of estimate intake in children 6–35 m varied regionally (5).	-		
Diet modeling: An Optifood analysis using data from the 2011 national FCS for Tigray, SNNPR, Amhara, and Oromia did not identify vitamin A to be a problem nutrient for children 6–23 m (6).			
Nutrient intake in WRA: Inadequate vitamin A	intake in 82% in the 2011 F	CS (5).	
Food supply nutrient availability: The amount inadequate for 90% of the national population ir		e food supply estimated to be	
Supplementation: National vitamin A suppleme (an increase from 53% in 2011) (2,3).	entation coverage for child	ren 6–59 m was 45% in 2016	
Calcium	Moderate burden gap	Moderate certainty evidence	
Dietary data: Animal milk was consumed by 16 ^d other milk products by 25% of breastfed childre Intake of both animal milk and other dairy produbased on a small population (2,3,10).	n 6–23 m in the past 24 h i	nationally in the 2016 DHS.	
Nutrient intake in children: A small 2010 study found calcium intake was < 50% of estimated ne	-		
Diet modeling: An Optifood analysis using data and Oromia found calcium intake between 80–9			
Food supply nutrient availability: The amount inadequate for 86% of the national population ir		food supply estimated to be	

¹⁰ The estimates for consumption of animal milk are for all children 6–23 months, however, it is recommended that children under 12 months of age do not consume milks (flavoured or plain) (11).

Folate	Moderate burden gap	Low certainty evidence			
Biochemical data: Prevalence of folate deficiency among non-pregnant WRA as measured by red blood cell folate < 340 nmol/L was 32% and as measured by serum folate < 6.8 nmol/L was 17% (1).					
Diet modeling: An Optifood analysis using da Amhara, and Oromia found inadequate folate 70–88% of RNI) (6).					
Food supply nutrient availability: The amount inadequate for 7% of the national population in		od supply estimated to be			
Vitamin C	Moderate burden gap	Low certainty evidence			
Nutrient intake in children: A small 2010 stud found median vitamin C intake well below estim					
Food supply nutrient availability: The amount inadequate for 60% of the national population i		e food supply estimated to be			
Vitamin B ₁₂	Low burden gap	Low certainty evidence			
Biochemical data: Vitamin B_{12} deficiency (serum $B_{12} < 203 \text{ pg/ml}$) was 15% in WRA in the 2014/15 NMS (1).					
Dietary data: Among breastfed children 6–23 m, 8% ate meat, fish, or poultry, 16% consumed animal milk, 25% consumed other dairy products, and 17% consumed eggs in the past 24 h nationally in the 2016 DHS (2).					
Diet modeling: An Optifood analysis using data Oromia found inadequate vitamin B ₁₂ intake for		ay, SNNPR, Amhara, and			
Food supply nutrient availability: The amount be inadequate for 40% of the national population		the food supply estimated to			
Vitamin B_1 (thiamine)	Low burden gap	Low certainty evidence			
Dietary data: 56% of breastfed children 6–23 m consumed grains (whole grains contain moderate amounts of thiamine) in the past 24 h nationally in the 2016 DHS (down from 66% in 2011 and 70% in 2005) (2,3,10).					
Diet modeling: An Optifood analysis using data and Oromia found inadequate thiamine intake fo of RNI (6).					

continued on next page

Niacin	Low burden gap	Low certainty evidence			
Dietary data: 8% children 6–23 m ate meat, fish, or poultry (best niacin sources) in the past 24 h nationally in the 2016 DHS (2).					
Diet modeling: An Optifood analysis using data from the 2011 national FCS for Tigray, SNNPR, Amhara, and Oromia found inadequate niacin intake for most children (ranged between 44 and 90% of RNI) (6).					
Food supply nutrient availability: The amount of niacin available in the food supply estimated to be inadequate for 2% of the national population in 2011 (7).					
Vitamin B ₆	No burden	Low certainty evidence			
Diet modeling: An Optifood analysis using data from the 2011 national FCS for Tigray, SNNPR, Amhara, and Oromia found adequate vitamin B ₆ intake for nearly all children (6).					
Food supply nutrient availability: The amount of vitamin B_6 available in the food supply estimated to be inadequate for 0% of the national population in 2011 (7).					

ANNEX REFERENCES

- 1. Ethiopian Public Health Institute. Ethiopian National Micronutrient Survey Report, 2016. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. 2016. https://www.ephi.gov.et/images/pictures/download2009/National_MNS_report.pdf.
- 2. Central Statistical Agency, Ethiopia and ICF. Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey, 2016. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia and Calverton, Maryland, USA. 2016. <u>https://dhsprogram.com/pubs/pdf/FR328/</u>FR328.pdf.
- 3. Central Statistical Agency, Ethiopia and ICF. Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey, 2011. ICF International Central Statistical Agency. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia and Calverton, Maryland, USA. 2011. https://dhsprogram.com/pubs/pdf/FR255/FR255.pdf.
- 4. Baye, K., Guyot, J. P., Icard-Verniere, C., & Mouquet-Rivier, C. Nutrient intakes from complementary foods consumed by young children (aged 12–23 months) from North Wollo, northern Ethiopia: the need for agro-ecologically adapted interventions. Public health nutrition, 16(10), 1741-1750. 2013.
- 5. Ethiopian Public Health Institute. Ethiopian National Food Consumption Survey, 2013. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. 2013. <u>https://www.ephi.gov.et/images/pictures/National%20Food%20Consumption%20</u> Survey%20Report_Ethiopia.pdf.
- MI. The identification of 'problem nutrients' and development of Food-based Recommendations for 6-23 month old children in the regions of Tigray, Amhara, Oromia, and SNNPR: Optifood Analysis. Micronutrient Initiative. 2015.
- 7. Beal, T., Massiot, E., Arsenault, J. E., Smith, M. R., & Hijmans, R. J. Global trends in dietary micronutrient supplies and estimated prevalence of inadequate intakes. 2017. PloS one, 12(4), e0175554.
- 8. Tigabu, E., Bekele, K. B., & Dachew, B. A. Prevalence of goiter and associated factors among schoolchildren in northeast Ethiopia. Epidemiology and health, 39. 2017.
- 9. Bekele, A., & Adilo, T. M. Prevalence of goiter and its associated factors among primary school children in Chole District, Arsi Zone, Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. BMC Nutrition, 5(1), 5. 2019.
- Central Statistical Agency, Ethiopia and ORC Macro. Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey 2005. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia and Calverton, Maryland, USA: Central Statistical Agency and ORC Macro. 2006. https://dhsprogram.com/pubs/pdf/FR179/FR179%5B23June2011%5D.pdf
- 11. Lott, M., Callahan, E., Welker Duffy, E., Story, M., Daniels, S. Healthy Beverage Consumption in Early Childhood: Recommendations from Key National Health and Nutrition Organizations. Consensus Statement. Durham, NC: Healthy Eating Research, 2019. http://healthyeatingresearch.org.

Recommended citation

GAIN and UNICEF. Comprehensive Nutrient Gap Assessment (CONGA): Findings for children 6–23 months in Ethiopia. GAIN. Geneva, Switzerland, 2019.

© The Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition (GAIN) and © United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF)

This work is available under the Creative Commons Attribution-Non-Commercial-Share Alike 4.0 IGO licence (CC BY-NC-SA 4.0 IGO; https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/). Under the terms of this licence, you may copy, redistribute and adapt the work for non-commercial purposes, provided the work is appropriately cited, as indicated below. In any use of this work, there should be no suggestion that GAIN endorses any specific organisation, products or services. The use of the GAIN logo is not permitted. If you adapt the work, then you must license your work under the same or equivalent Creative Commons license. The contribution of third parties do not necessarily represent the view or opinion of GAIN or UNICEF.

Acknowledgements

This briefing paper was written by Jessica M White, Heather Kelahan, and Ty Beal. It was produced by GAIN and UNICEF under the Regional Initiatives for Sustained Nutrition and Growth (RISING) program, supported by the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation and the Ministry of the Foreign Affairs of the Netherlands. We thank nutrition teams in UNICEF ESARO and Headquarters for their helpful feedback on earlier drafts; Saul S Morris and Alison Tumilowicz for their contribution to the methods; Joanne E Arsenault, Harriet Okronipa, and Guy-Marino Hinnouho for their role as expert reviewers; and Wendy Gonzalez and Sharada Keats for their help framing this briefing paper series. Cover photo credit: ©Shutterstock/Kimberly Petts.

Contact

Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition (GAIN) Rue de Varembé 7 1002 Geneva, Switzerland

T: +41 22 749 18 50 E: info@gainhealth.org www.gainhealth.org



